

Kathryn Hernandez/EPR/R8/US EPA/US

05/30/2006 09:56 AM

To Maureen OReilly/ENF/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, Peggy Livingston/ENF/R8/USEPA/US@EPA

CC

bcc

Subject Fw: Fwd: CWA issues settled

Kathryn Hernandez USEPA, Region VIII (8EPR-SR) 999 18th Street, Ste 300 Denver, CO 80202 (303) 312-6101(office) (720) 951-0974(cell)

----- Forwarded by Kathryn Hernandez/EPR/R8/USEPA/US on 05/30/2006 09:56 AM -----



Kevin Murray <kmurray@chapman.co m>

To Kathryn Hernandez/EPR/R8/USEPA/US@EPA

CC

05/25/2006 04:59 PM

Subject Fwd:

This keeps returning, hopefully this will work.

Begin forwarded message:

> From: Kevin Murray < kmurray@chapman.com>

> Date: May 25, 2006 4:47:37 PM MDT

> To: "Mark C. Elmer" < Mark. Elmer@usdoj.gov>,

> KathrynHernandez@tmo.blackberry.net, Livingston.Peggy@epamail.epa.gov

> Cc: Kerry Gee <kcgee@unitedpark.com>

>

> As we discussed yesterday

>

CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE:

ANY STATEMENTS REGARDING TAX MATTERS MADE HEREIN, INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS, CANNOT BE RELIED UPON BY ANY PERSON TO AVOID TAX PENALTIES AND ARE NOT INTENDED TO BE USED OR REFERRED TO IN ANY MARKETING OR PROMOTIONAL MATERIALS. TO THE EXTENT THIS COMMUNICATION CONTAINS A TAX STATEMENT OR TAX ADVICE, CHAPMAN AND CUTLER LLP DOES NOT AND WILL NOT IMPOSE ANY LIMITATION ON DISCLOSURE OF THE TAX TREATMENT OR TAX STRUCTURE OF ANY TRANSACTIONS TO WHICH SUCH TAX STATEMENT OR TAX ADVICE RELATES.

Chapman and Cutler LLP is an Illinois limited liability partnership that has elected to be governed by the Illinois Uniform Partnership Act (1997).



CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE:

ANY STATEMENTS REGARDING TAX MATTERS MADE HEREIN, INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS, CANNOT BE RELIED UPON BY ANY PERSON TO AVOID TAX PENALTIES AND ARE NOT INTENDED TO BE USED OR REFERRED TO IN ANY MARKETING OR PROMOTIONAL MATERIALS. TO THE EXTENT THIS COMMUNICATION CONTAINS A TAX STATEMENT OR TAX ADVICE, CHAPMAN AND CUTLER LLP DOES NOT AND WILL NOT IMPOSE ANY LIMITATION ON DISCLOSURE OF THE TAX TREATMENT OR TAX STRUCTURE OF ANY TRANSACTIONS TO WHICH SUCH TAX STATEMENT OR TAX ADVICE RELATES.

Chapman and Cutler LLP is an Illinois limited liability partnership that has elected to be governed by the Illinois Uniform Partnership Act (1997).

Law Offices of

CHAPMAN AND CUTLER 11P

Theodore S. Chapman 1877-1943 Henry E. Cutler 1879-1959 201 South Main Street, Salt Lake City, Utah 84111-2266
Telephone (801) 533-0066
Facsimile (801) 533-9595
chapman.com

Chicago 111 West Monroe Street Chicago, IL 60603 (312) 845-3000

San Francisco 595 Market Street San Francisco, CA 94105 (415) 541-0500

kmurray@chapman.com Direct Dial: (801) 320-6754

May 25, 2006

Mark C. Elmer Trial Attorney Environmental Enforcement Section U.S. Department of Justice 999 Eighteenth Street, Suite 945 Denver, CO 80202

Richardson Flat Site: Supplemental RD/RA Consent Decree Comments

Dear Mark:

Re:

We appreciated the opportunity to discuss the RD/RA Consent Decree ("RD/RA CD") with you and EPA on the telephone last Monday. We are pleased to see that relatively few issues remain to be resolved in order to reach a final agreement. This letter is to follow up on a few outstanding issues.

- 1. Covenant Not to Sue Clean Water Act. After further discussions with my colleagues and conversations that took place between Kathryn Hernandez and Kerry Gee, we have decided to withdraw our request that the United States' covenant include specific reference to claims under the Clean Water Act. This conclusion is based in large part on our agreement with EPA's position that the risk of discharges of contaminants to a water of the United States during the course of remediation is extremely attenuated. We also find comfort in CERCLA's permit shield as set forth in Section 121(e) as it relates to the Site and this Consent Decree.
- 2. Performance Guarantee. Our client's preference is to satisfy the performance guarantee requirement by demonstrating that it meets the financial test criteria set forth in 40 C.F.R. Section 264.143(f) with respect to the Estimated Costs of the Work and/or through a written guarantee to fund or perform the Work by a corporate affiliate of United Park City Mines Company ("United Park"). We are familiar with the financial test requirements set forth in the regulations and are confident United Park will be able to satisfy the test. The company is also willing to covenant to maintain a minimum net worth of \$10 million at all times during the course of the remedial action. For various business reasons, however, United Park is extremely sensitive about releasing important corporate financial information to a public agency where that information may or may not be protected from disclosure to third parties. We would like to

Law Offices of

CHAPMAN AND CUTLER LLP

suggest an approach where United Park would retain an independent accounting firm of EPA's choice that would review United Park's financial information and if appropriate, will certify to EPA that the company has met the requirements, including the company's compliance with its agreement to maintain a minimum net worth of \$10 million. Under this approach, the sensitive financial information would not be disclosed to EPA. In our experience, EPA sometimes retains outside firms to provide assistance in such matters and we believe this approach would be sufficient to address our client's sensitivities about disclosure of financial information.

Again, we thank your for your attention to this matter and look forward to reaching a mutually agreeable solution that will allow remediation of the Richard Flat Site to begin as soon as possible.

Very truly yours,

CHAPMAN AND COTLER LLP

KRM:pw